MODULE 7: CRITICAL EDITING

Ron Van den Branden
Edward Vanhoutte
Melissa Terras

Centre for Scholarly Editing and Document Studies (CTB), Royal Academy of Dutch Language and Literature, Belgium, Gent, 9 July 2010
Last updated September 2020
Licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution ShareAlike 3.0 License
TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. Emily Dickinson: “Faith is a Fine Invention”.......................... 1
2. Christopher Marlowe: Edward II........................................... 5
1. Emily Dickinson: "Faith is a Fine Invention"

The following example is a critical edition of Emily Dickinson’s poem “Faith is a Fine Invention,” encoded and made available by the University of Maryland University Libraries.

In this example, 7 different versions of a 4-line poem are encoded using the parallel segmentation method. Each apparatus entry (<app>) contains different <rdg> elements documenting the variants occurring in the different text versions. Notice how the choice for equal <rdg> elements (instead of one “preferred” reading, encoded in a <lem> element), and the use of the parallel segmentation method abolish the notion of a base text.

The different witnesses are listed in a <listWit> element inside the <front> section of the text. Each witness definition inside <witness> marks its corresponding sigil in an @xml:id attribute. In the final line, a page break is recorded with <pb>. Its @ed attribute is used to identify the specific edition where this page breaks occurs: the text witness identified as l1894. Notice, how this could have been expressed even more formally with the @edRef attribute, which takes a pointer to an edition identified elsewhere: <pb facs="#image1" edRef="#l1894"/>.

REFERENCE

See Module 6: Primary Sources, section 3.2 for a discussion of the @facs attribute.

```
<TEI xmlns="http://www.tei-c.org/ns/1.0">
  <teiHeader>
    <fileDesc>
      <titleStmt>
        <title>"Faith is a fine invention"</title>
        <author>Emily Dickinson</author>
        <respStmt>
          <name>Jarom McDonald</name>
          <resp>Text encoding</resp>
        </respStmt>
        <respStmt>
          <name>Lara Vetter</name>
          <resp>Proofing</resp>
        </respStmt>
      </titleStmt>
    </fileDesc>
  </teiHeader>
</TEI>
```
This poem is available only for demonstration purposes. It was created as part of a research project to experiment with ways of displaying multiple witnesses of a TEI-encoded poem using XML, XSLT and JavaScript.

See Witness List.


DTD constructed from TEI prose base with tagsets for linking, figures, analysis, transcr, textcrit.
"Faith is a fine invention"

1. Emily Dickinson: "Faith is a Fine Invention"
<app>
  <rdg wit="#a660 #h201 #h72">Gentlemen</rdg>  
  <rdg wit="#p1891 #l1894 #cp32 #ll227">gentlemen</rdg>
</app>

<app>
  <rdg wit="#a660 #l227">can</rdg>  
  <rdg wit="#h201 #h72 #p1891 #l1894 #cp32">who</rdg>  
  <rdg wit="#h72 #ll227">!</rdg>  
  <rdg wit="#a660 #h201"> -</rdg>  
  <rdg wit="#p1891 #cp32">;</rdg>  
  <rdg wit="#l1894">,</rdg>  
</app>

<l n="3"> But <app>
  <rdg wit="#h72">Microscopes</rdg>  
  <rdg wit="#a660 #h201">Microscopes</rdg>  
  <hi rend="underline">Microscopes</hi>  
</app> are prudent</l>

<l n="4"> In an <app>
  <rdg wit="#a660 #h201 #h72">Emergency</rdg>  
  <rdg wit="#p1891 #l1894 #cp32 #ll227">emergency</rdg>  
</app> 
</l>
1. Emily Dickinson: “Faith is a Fine Invention”

2. Christopher Marlowe: Edward II

The following example is a fragment of a critical edition of Christopher Marlowe’s play Edward II, encoded and made available by the Perseus Digital Library.

This example illustrates the critical encoding of a drama work. The <variantEncoding> element in the TEI header specifies that an internal, parallel segmented apparatus is used for the encoding of textual variation. The (many) text witnesses that are included in the edition are identified in a <listWit> section in the front matter of the edition. Although more detailed information is lacking (the header section of the original file is rather incomplete, and hence left out from this example), the location of the witness definitions in the front matter may suggest that this critical edition has been digitised from an existing print original. Each witness is described in a <witness> element and provided with an @xml:id attribute specifying the sigil that will be used in the edition to refer to this text witness. One subgroup of text witnesses is identified in a nesting <listWit> element: the “D” sigil will be used to refer to both Dyce editions collectively.

Using a parallel segmented apparatus, the actual text contains all invariant text that is shared among all witnesses, while the variants are captured in <app> elements at the exact places where they occur.

Although a full description of this edition is not available, this example can illustrate what information can be inferred from a parallel segmented apparatus. First, the notion of a base text seems to have been adopted for this edition, as can be gathered from the use of <lem> elements. Without more information, however, it is impossible to tell what text witness has been adopted as base text, because most <lem> element don’t have any @wit information. Moreover, those lemmas with explicit sigla in a @wit attribute contradict each other: some refer to witness Q2, others to Q4. Some <app> elements don’t have a <lem> reading; this may either be a mistake, or suggest that this variant does not occur in the base text (but then, the occurrence of empty <rdg> elements would
suggest that empty `<lem>` elements would be used in these cases). Apparently, only those text witnesses whose text differs from that of the base text have been recorded in `<rdg>` attributes of the concerned `<rdg>` elements. One apparatus entry contains two groups of readings:

```xml
<app xmlns="http://www.tei-c.org/ns/1.0">
  <lem>yong</lem>
  <rdg wit="#0x #R #Q3">
    <app>
      <lem>you</lem>
      <rdg wit="#Q3"/>
    </app>
  </rdg>
</app>
```

The grouping reading suggests that all text witnesses have the “yong” variant, except for the 0x, R, and Q3 witnesses. Its embedded `<app>` element then seems to tacitly adopt the reading of the 0x and R witnesses (“you”) as lemma, while this reading is entirely missing from the Q3 witness.

```xml
<text xmlns="http://www.tei-c.org/ns/1.0">
  <front>
    <div>
      <listWit>
        <witness xml:id="Q1">Quarto 1, 1594</witness>
        <witness xml:id="Q2">Quarto 2, 1598</witness>
        <witness xml:id="Q3">Quarto 3, 1612</witness>
        <witness xml:id="Q4">Quarto 4, 1622</witness>
        <witness xml:id="Dd1">Old Plays», ed. Dodsley, 1744</witness>
        <witness xml:id="Dd2">Old Plays», ed. Dodsley, ed. Reed, 1780</witness>
        <witness xml:id="S">2. Christopher Marlowe: Edward II 6
```
<bibl><title>Ancient British Drama</title>, ed. Sir Walter Scott, 1810</bibl>
<witness xml:id="Ch">
  <bibl><title>Edward the Second</title>, sold by J. Chappell, Jr., 1818</bibl>
</witness>
<witness xml:id="Ox">
  <bibl><title>Edward the Second</title>, ed. William Oxberry, 1818</bibl>
</witness>
<witness xml:id="Dd3">
  <bibl><title>Old Plays</title>, Dodsley, ed. Collier, 1825</bibl>
</witness>
<witness xml:id="R">
  <bibl><title>Works</title>, Robinson, 1826</bibl>
</witness>
<listWit xml:id="D">
  <witness xml:id="D1">
    <bibl><title>Works</title>, Dyce 1, 1850</bibl>
  </witness>
  <witness xml:id="D2">
    <bibl><title>Works</title>, Dyce 2, 1858</bibl>
  </witness>
</listWit>
<witness xml:id="C">
  <bibl><title>Works</title>, Cunningham, 1870</bibl>
</witness>
<witness xml:id="B">
  <bibl><title>Works</title>, Bullen, 1885</bibl>
</witness>
<witness xml:id="TB">
  <bibl><title>Works</title>, Tucker Brooke, 1910</bibl>
</witness>
<witness xml:id="Bgs">
  <bibl><title>Edward the Second</title>, Briggs, 1914</bibl>
</witness>
<witness xml:id="Gg">
  <bibl><title>Edward the Second</title>, Malone Society Reprints, ed. W. W. Greg, 1925</bibl>
</witness>

2. Christopher Marlowe: Edward II
Act Four, Scene Two

Enter the Queen and her son.

Queen

A boy, our friends do faile us all in France. The lords are cruel, and the king unkind.

What shall we do?

Christopher Marlowe: Edward II 8
<speaker>Prince</speaker>

Madam, returne to <name>England</name>,
And please my father well, and then a Fig.

For all my unckles frienship here in <name>Fraunce</name>,

I warrant you, ile winne his highnes quicklie,

Ac

He Dd1 -

loves me better than a thousand <name>Spencers</name>.

Queene

A boye, thou art deceivde at least in this,
To thinke that we can yet be tun'd together,
No, no, we jarre too <app>

Unkinde, unkinde <name>Valoys</name>,

Unhappie <name>Isabell</name>, when <name>Fraunce</name> rejects,

Whether, O <app>

whether <app>

doost</app>

thou bend thy steps <app>

? </app>

</app>

</sp>

Enter sir <name>John</name>

of <name>Henolt</name>.
<sp who="sirj">
  <speaker>Sir John</speaker>
  <l>Madam, what cheere?</l>
</sp>

<sp who="quee">
  <speaker>Queene</speaker>
  <l>A good sir <name>John</name> of <name>Henolt</name>,
  Never so cheereles, nor so farre distrest.</l>
</sp>

<sp who="sirj">
  <speaker>Sir John</speaker>
  <l>I heare sweete lady of the kings unkindenes,
  But droope not madam, noble mindes contemne</l>
  <l>Despaire: will your grace with me to <name>Henolt</name>,
  And there stay times advantage with your sonne?</l>
  <l>How say you my Lord, will you go with your friends</l>
</sp>

<sp who="prin">
  <speaker>Prince</speaker>
  <l>So pleaseth the Queene my mother, me it likes</l>
  <l>The king of <name>England</name>, the court of <name>Fraunce</name>,
  Shall <name>have</name> me from my gratious mothers side</l>
</sp>
Till I be strong enough to breake a staffe,
And then have at the proudest Spencers head.

Sir John
Well said my lord.

Queene
Oh my sweet hart, how do I mone thy wrong,
Yet triumphe in the hope of thee my joye?
Ah sweete sir John, even to the utmost verge
of Europe, the shore of Tanaise,

The Marques is a noble Gentleman,
His grace I dare presume will welcome me,
But what are these?

Enter Edmund [earle of Kent] and Mortimer.

2. Christopher Marlowe: Edward II
Madam, long may you live,
Much happier then your friends in England do.

Lord Edmund and lord Mortimer alive,
Welcome to Fraunce: the newes was heere my lord,
That you were dead, or very neare your death.

Lady, the last was truest of the twaine,
But Mortimer reservde for better hap,
Hath shaken off the thraldome of the tower,
And lives to advance your standard good my lord.
How meane you, and the king my father lives ?

No my lord <name>Mortimer</name>, not I, I trow.

Not sonne, why not? I would it were no worse,

But gentle lords, friendles we are in <name>Fraunce</name>.

Mounsier <name><app>le Grand</app></name>, a noble friend of yours,

Tould us at our arrivall all the newes,

How hard the nobles, how unkinde the king

Hath shewed himself: but madam, right makes roome,

Where weapons

And made away, as <name>Warwick, Lancaster</name>,

And others of our

And <app>

And <app>

And <app>,

2. Christopher Marlowe: Edward II
Yet have we friends, assure your grace in England, would cast up cappes, and clap their hands for joy, To see us there appointed for our foes.

Kent: Would all were well, and Edward well reclaimd, For Englands honor, peace, and quietnes.

Mortimer: But by the sword, my lord, it must be deserv'd. The king will nere forsake his flatterers.

Sir John: My Lords of England, sith the ungentle king of Fraunce refuseth to give aide of armes, refuseth to give aide of armes,
To this distressed Queene his sister heere,
Go you with her to Menolt,
We will finde comfort, money, men, and friends
Ere long, to bid the English king a base,
How say you Yong Prince, what thinke you of the match?
I thinke king Edward will out-run us all.
Nay,
Your friends that are so forward in your aide.

Sir John of Henolt, pardon us I pray,

These comforts that you give our wofull queene,

Bind us in kindenes all at your commaund.

Yea gentle brother, and the God of heaven,

Prosper your happie motion good sir John.

This noble gentleman, forward in armes,

Was borne I see to be our anchor hold

Sir John of Henolt, be it thy renowne,

That Englands Queene, and nobles in distresse,

Have beene by thee restored and comforted.

Madam along, and you my lord
Example 2. Adapted from a TEI P4 XML encoding of Christopher Marlowe’s play Edward II (Marlowe 1594).

BIBLIOGRAPHY
